



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
-----------------	-------------	----------------------	---------------------	------------------

10/665,981

09/19/2003

Harold R. Garner

UTSW:1063

5373

34725

7590

07/11/2008

CHALKER FLORES, LLP
2711 LBJ FRWY
Suite 1036
DALLAS, TX 75234

EXAMINER

LU, CHARLES EDWARD

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

2161

MAIL DATE

DELIVERY MODE

07/11/2008

PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Office Action Summary	Application No. 10/665,981	Applicant(s) GARNER ET AL.	
	Examiner CHARLES E. LU	Art Unit 2161	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 1 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 03 February 2008.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-34,45-61,64,68,69,109-112,127-138 and 151 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☒ Claim(s) See Continuation Sheet are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413) |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ |

Continuation of Disposition of Claims: Claims subject to restriction and/or election requirement are 1-34,45-61,64,68,69,109-112,127-138 and 151.

DETAILED ACTION

1. Claims 1-34, 45-61, 64, 68, 69, 109-112, 127-138 and 151 are pending and subject to restriction.

Election/Restrictions

2. Restriction to one of the following inventions is required under 35 U.S.C. 121:

Group I

A system, computer program, or data structure drawn to a knowledge discovery engine where relationships between two or more integrated objects are identified, retrieved, grouped, ranked, filtered and numerically evaluated. Claims 1-29, 45-61, 64, 68-69, 109, 111, 127-128, 133-135, and 151, classified in class 707, subclass 2.

Group II

A system drawn to a knowledge discovery engine that recognizes relationships and identifies one or more co occurrences of objects within the data source, and identifies implicit relationships between the objects. Claims 30-34, 45-61, 64, 68-69, and 151, classified in class 707, subclass 102.

Group III

A computer program drawn to constructing a database of lexical variants, scanning an object-relationship database with a database of lexical variants to add

synonyms; and assigning each object a unique numeric ID and storing relationships by lowest ID first; and checking the object-relationship database for errors. Claim 110, classified in class 707, subclass 7.

Group IV

A data structure drawn to generating a comprehensive network of relationships and storing the shared relationships evaluated by one or more statistical bounded network models, wherein a query is performed on the shared relationships to identify novel relationships from the comprehensive network of relationships. Claim 112, classified in class 707/104.1.

Group V

A method drawn to identifying objects directly and indirectly related to query objects and quantitatively evaluating each implicitly related object to determine a probability that it shares a meaningful relationship with the query object by deriving an importance score and a veracity score. Claims 136-138, classified in class 707, subclass 5.

The inventions are distinct, each from the other because of the following reasons:

Groups I - V are related as subcombinations disclosed as usable together in a single combination. The subcombinations are distinct from each other if they are shown to be separately usable. In the instant case, Group I has a separate utility such as

Art Unit: 2161

identifying, retrieving, grouping, ranking, filtering and numerically evaluating relationships between objects. Group II has a separate utility such as identifying co-occurrences of objects and implicit relationships between objects. Group III has a separate utility such as constructing a database of lexical variants, scanning an object-relationship database with a database of lexical variants to add synonyms, assigning each object a unique numeric ID and storing relationships by lowest ID first; and checking the object-relationship database for errors. Group IV has a separate utility such as generating a comprehensive network of relationships and storing the shared relationships evaluated by one or more statistical bounded network models, wherein a query is performed on the shared relationships to identify novel relationships from the comprehensive network of relationships. Group V has a separate utility such as identifying objects directly and indirectly related to query objects and quantitatively evaluating each implicitly related object to determine a probability that it shares a meaningful relationship with the query object by deriving an importance score and a veracity score. Each group does not require the particulars of the other groups. See MPEP § 806.05(d).

Because these inventions are distinct for the reasons given above and have acquired a separate status in the art as shown by their different classification, restriction for examination purposes as indicated is proper. Furthermore, the search required for each group would be different. There would be a serious burden on the examiner if restriction was not required.

Applicant is advised that the reply to this requirement to be complete must include an election of the invention to be examined even though the requirement is traversed (37 CFR 1.143).

Applicant is reminded that upon the cancellation of claims to a non-elected invention, the inventorship must be amended in compliance with 37 CFR 1.48(b) if one or more of the currently named inventors is no longer an inventor of at least one claim remaining in the application. Any amendment of inventorship must be accompanied by a request under 37 CFR 1.48(b) and by the fee required under 37 CFR 1.17(i).

Conclusion

3. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Charles E. Lu whose telephone number is (571) 272-8594. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:30 - 5:00; M-F.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Apu Mofiz can be reached at (571) 272-4080. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

/Charles E Lu/
Examiner, Art Unit 2161
7/14/2008

/Apu M Mofiz/
Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 2161